

Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, February 4, 2020

Hyperlink to [Meeting Video](#)

Community Plan Advisory Committee

Attending: Chair Kai Nishiki, Hans Michel, Karen J. Comcowich, Ravi Bugga, Donald Robert Gerbig, Joseph D. Pluta, Dylan Payne, Leilani Pulmano, Angela Lucero

Absent: Vice-Chair Jeri Dean, Dawn Hegger-Nordblom, Yvette Joyce Celiz, Aina Kohler

County of Maui – Planning Department

Pam Eaton, Long Range Planning Division

Jennifer Maydan, Long Range Planning Division

Dan McNulty-Huffman, Long Range Planning Division

Mike Napier, Long Range Planning Division

Jaime Paa, Long Range Planning Division

Call to order at 5:37 p.m.

Public Testimony (00:00 to 50:36 in Meeting Video)

Tom Blackburn-Rodriguez referenced the section on Community Plans in the County Ordinance and noted that the Expansion Alternative map represents the Kā'anapali 2020 vision, and the urbanized area in it is within the Urban Growth Boundaries, which were approved by the Maui County Council for the Maui Island Plan. He suggested that any Agriculture designations located within the Urban Growth Boundaries be eliminated, and urged members to recognize the efforts of those who worked on the Kā'anapali 2020 Plan for the past 22 years.

'Ekolu Lindsey voiced his support for the Kā'anapali 2020 project, which his father had been involved in from its inception. He noted that it is one of the few "true" community plans due to its involvement of longtime Lahaina residents. Karen Comcowich asked 'Ekolu for input on Hanaka'o'o Beach Park; he deferred to Chad Fukunaga to answer Karen's question later in the meeting, when the area is being discussed.

Rory Frampton, representing Court Johnson, requested changing the designation of the China Boat Restaurant property from Residential to Neighborhood Center. ([Link to written testimony](#))

Albert Perez cited a study done by Maui Tomorrow in 1989, which concluded that the Community Plan designations at the time could accommodate three times as much of the current population. He stressed that CPAC does not need to add any more areas to accommodate growth, and that areas should instead be designated for truly affordable housing. Questions from CPAC include suggestions on how to designate those areas, and clarification on Maui Tomorrow's study.

Ke'eaumoku Kapu provided a handout to members containing a checklist of laws that must be followed so that the rights of Native Hawaiians are not infringed upon. (Link to handouts: [Aha Moku System and Collaborative Governance](#), [Traditional and Customary Hawaiian Rights](#)) He noted that 'Aha Moku must be involved before any final decisions are made - not necessarily with the CPAC body, but with the Planning Department. Questions from CPAC included whether any of the projects present at the January 21 meeting had gone through the 'Aha Moku Council system; whether Ke'eaumoku has any concerns with the areas being covered in tonight's meeting; and clarification on who the 'Aha Moku po'o (head) for Kā'anapali is (for consultation).

Peter Martin noted that there are many hotels being built, but not many subdivisions in West Maui for local people to buy.

Puanani Lindsey expressed her hope that the CPAC will see to it that the work of the Kā'anapali 2020 plan gets done. She noted that while the hope is for Lahaina people to get affordable housing, we must remember that affordable housing open to everyone who meets the requirements, not just those who live in Lahaina.

U'ilani Kapu asked members to consider breaking the map into two parts – the Lahaina moku and the Kā'anapali moku. She also noted that she is in favor of the Department of Hawaiian Homelands (DHHL) and Honokowai projects, and stressed the importance of protecting archaeological and burial sites as well as having safeguards in planning. Questions from CPAC included what the Kapu family plans to do for their children (regarding affordable housing); the in-fighting between Native Hawaiians and why they are so vocal; and possible solutions to listing the moku on the map.

Cilla Kaina testified as a representative of the Kā'anapali moku. She shared that Native Hawaiians in Kā'anapali are thriving, but noted how unfortunate it is to not see her *kanaka* (Native Hawaiian people) on the CPAC. She said that she is grateful for the opportunity to share how important her culture and heritage to her. Questions from CPAC included if Cilla had attended or been involved in prior Kā'anapali 2020 plan meetings.

John Seabart noted that there are too many tourists and not enough housing, and stressed the need to find ways to prevent the growth that is being predicted.

Review: Draft West Maui Community Plan, Growth Framework Section – Kā’anapali Subarea (50:44 to 2:18:35)

Jennifer Maydan briefly went over members’ responsibility in tonight’s meeting. She introduced the resource people available: representatives from the Kā’anapali moku, Chad Fukunaga (Kā’anapali Land Development Corporation), Ann Cua (Planning Department – Current Division) and Dave Yamashita (Department of Parks and Recreation).

Jennifer then went over the Kā’anapali Planned Growth Area and pointed out a few of the areas/features that members may want to focus on. She asked members to come up with a list of places to look at. The list is as follows:

- Pulelehua
- Kā’anapali 2020 (PQP area, Pu’ukoli’i Village, Kā’anapali Town South)
- China Boat Restaurant property
- Ala Hoku Ag subdivision
- PQP north of Pulelehua/south of the highway
- Kā’anapali Golf Course (mauka and makai of the highway)
- Kahana area
- Two Minatoya properties (Kahana Outrigger and Papakea)
- Potential site for transfer station/recycling center

Kā’anapali 2020 (including Pu’ukoli’i Village and Kā’anapali Town South) (1:07:33 to 2:18:35)

Discussion:

- Questions from CPAC to Planning staff and Chad Fukunaga included clarification on density allocation for each Community Plan designation area; having access roadways from the bypass to Honoapi’ilani Highway on the map; how to deal with the cemetery behind Hanaka’ō’ō Beach Park; the history of and logic behind the Pu’ukoli’i project; what entitlements Kā’anapali 2020 is missing; whether the Resort/Hotel designations are for managed retreat; whether construction plans have been submitted, and if plans can still move forward despite any designation changes CPAC may make.

- **Leilani Pulmano made a motion to add Pu'ukoli'i Village on the map as a Small Town Center designation; Dylan Payne seconded the motion.**
 - Questions and discussion from CPAC included why the designation wasn't included in the Department Recommended Alternative to begin with; clarification on entitlements already in place; the Planning Department's recommendation for a community plan designation for this area; when the plans for this area were submitted to the County; why no development has started despite entitlements from over 20 years ago; and whether there is a condition in the entitlements that requires a school.
 - **Chair Nishiki amended Leilani's motion to include a condition that Kā'anapali Town South remains an Agriculture designation upon approval of Leilani's motion. Angela Lucero seconded the motion.**
 - Discussion included whether or not there is any liability or impacts to Kā'anapali 2020 if Kā'anapali Town South is designated Agriculture.
 - Chair Nishiki and members Ravi Bugga, Angela Lucero and Karen Comcowich voted in favor of the motion, while members Hans Michel, Joseph Pluta, Donald Gerbig, Dylan Payne, and Leilani Pulmano opposed.
- **4-5, AMENDMENT FAILS.**
- **For Leilani's motion**, members Hans Michel, Joseph Pluta, Donald Gerbig, Ravi Bugga, Dylan Payne, Karen Comcowich and Leilani Pulmano voted in favor, while Chair Nishiki and member Angela Lucero opposed. **7-2, MOTION PASSES.**
- **Leilani then made a motion to keep Kā'anapali Town South's designation as Agriculture; Angela Lucero seconded the motion.**
 - 'Aha Moku representatives Cilla Kaina, Deanne Kaina, Ke'eaumoku Kapu and U'ilani Kapu provided for their input regarding Kā'anapali Town South. Chad Fukunaga also provided his thoughts on Leilani's motion.
 - Dylan Payne pointed out that regardless of how the vote on the motion goes, the designation for Kā'anapali Town South will still remain Agriculture, since that is what is already listed on the Department Recommended Alternative. Leilani noted that she wanted to have a healthy discussion on the matter and **rescinded her motion.**
- **Chair Nishiki made a motion to designate Kā'anapali Town South as Parks/Open Space; Karen Comcowich seconded the motion.** Chair Nishiki and members Ravi Bugga, Angela Lucero, Karen Comcowich and Leilani Pulmano voted in favor of the motion, while members Hans Michel, Joseph Pluta, Donald Gerbig and Dylan Payne opposed. **5-4, MOTION FAILS.**

RECESS/DINNER BREAK

Review: Draft West Maui Community Plan, Growth Framework Section – Kā’anapali Subarea (Cont.) (2:18:35 to END)

Kā’anapali Town North and Kā’anapali Town (2:18:35 to 2:31:22)

Discussion:

- **Ravi Bugga made a motion to approve the Department’s Recommendation for Small Town Center; Dylan Payne seconded the motion.**
 - Leilani Pulmano asked for Chad Fukunaga’s input on the motion; Chad noted that the Kā’anapali 2020 Community Group supports designations that align with the Expanded Alternative.
- Questions from members included clarification on the need for separately designating Public/Quasi Public (PQP) areas when PQP uses are allowed within the Small Town Center (STC) designations; why the Kā’anapali 2020 Community Group is asking for an Urban Center/Corridor designation; and what the plans are for the proposed hospital site.
- All voted in favor; **MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.**

China Boat Restaurant Property (2:31:46 to 2:36:54)

Discussion:

- **Dylan Payne made a motion to designate the China Boat Restaurant property as Neighborhood Center. Karen Comcowich seconded the motion.**
 - Questions from members included the developer’s plans; whether sea-level rise is addressed in those plans; and whether the land owner would object to a condition that sea-level rise and flooding be considered in future plans for that area.
- All voted in favor; **MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.**

Minatoya Properties (Kahana Outrigger and Papakea) (2:38:00 to 2:49:35)

Discussion:

- Jennifer Maydan reminded members of Michele McLean’s suggestion to change the designation for these properties to Resort/Hotel due to the number of short term rentals on the properties.
 - Members discussed the implications of a Resort/Hotel designation for the future, specifically whether a new developer could come in and build a new, bigger hotel and hamper the County’s plans to sunset grandfathered short-term rentals.
- **Ravi Bugga made a motion to keep the designation for the two Minatoya properties as Residential; Donald Gerbig seconded the motion.** Chair Nishiki and members Joseph Pluta, Donald Gerbig, Ravi Bugga, Karen Comcowich, Angela Lucero and Leilani Pulmano voted in favor of the motion, while members Hans Michel and Dylan Payne opposed. **7-2, MOTION PASSES.**

Before adjourning, members agreed that it was appropriate to add an additional “If Needed” meeting the following week to discuss the rest of the areas that they were unable to discuss that evening due to time constraints.

NEXT MEETING IS ON FEBRUARY 6, 2020. MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:58 P.M.

